



**ADVERTISING
RESEARCH**
FOUNDATION

JAR's 50TH Anniversary Issue

If there's one thing I've learned in my career, it is the necessity of always challenging what you think you know. Success in our fast-changing world demands this of us as we continually adapt and innovate to meet new challenges. For 75 years, the Advertising Research Foundation has brought together experts from all walks of marketing life to share and build knowledge that not only addresses our most complex issues, but also helps transform the way we do business.

Millward Brown has long been a proud partner and supporter of the ARF, and I was personally honored to have served as a member of their Board of Directors. We both share a long and deep heritage of commitment to research and a hunger to elevate the role insights play in driving businesses forward.

This spirit of celebrating our past achievements while also looking towards the future informs this very special edition of the Journal of Advertising Research, which we are pleased to be part of. Not only does it feature some of the important research thinking from the past 50 years, it also gives us food for thought as we contemplate where the next 50 years might take us. We live in an exciting time for our industry, which is undergoing great change, and we must evolve along with it. Whatever future challenges we face, I know that the ARF will be there as a valuable partner in our collective evolution and transformation.

Mary Ann Packo, CEO, Millward Brown North America

13 The Interactive Web: Toward a New Discipline

HAIRONG LI

- This paper is a sketch of significant studies on the Web and interactive advertising in the *Journal of Advertising Research* for the past 15 years.
- Since the early 1990s, the World Wide Web has been used not only as an advertising vehicle itself but also as a platform for new forms of interactive advertising, such as display ads, sponsorship, search ads, and more recently, blogs and microblogs, social ads, user-generated content, as well as widgets and apps.
- This area requires research that can discover the dynamic, synergistic, and networked ways various forms of interactive advertising work in the market.
- To address these changes and move our profession forward, future studies need to take advantage of newer approaches such as neuroscience and biometric techniques, behavioral economics, network analysis, and mining of massive data among others.

27 The Tension between Strategy and Execution: Challenges for International Advertising Research—Globalization is Much More Than Universal Branding

JOHN B. FORD, BARBARA MUELLER, and CHARLES R. TAYLOR; Insights from NIGEL HOLLIS

- Evidence abounds that a standardized advertising strategy is more feasible than in the past and often more desirable in that it can help build a global brand.
- An increasing number of corporations have taken advantage of the emergence of global consumer culture by shifting their brand portfolios in favor of global brands.
- It is encouraging to observe that several new theories originating in international business/strategic management (e.g., resource advantage theory; global marketing strategy theory; and global consumer culture positioning theory and the related concepts of global brand positioning and perceived brand globalness) have recently begun to be applied to international advertising.
- Much more work needs to be done to identify and understand differences across cultural units of analysis and to determine how advertising strategies can be adjusted for the greatest possible impact on the perceptions of consumers while at the same time minimizing negative societal impacts.
- The future looks bright for cross-cultural research in advertising, as theory development and testing are leading to better explanatory models, and the debates over approaches to scale development and equivalence are extremely healthy for researchers and practitioners.

42 From Silos to Synergy: A Fifty-year Review of Cross-media Research Shows Synergy Has Yet to Achieve its Full Potential

HENRY ASSAEL

- The technology resulting in the proliferation of media has outstripped the means to measure cross-media effectiveness.
- The promise of cross-media research will not be achieved until cross-media effectiveness can be linked to sales and ROI. Until that is achieved, cross-media research will continue to have a silo orientation and operate on the periphery of marketing planning.
- Cross-media exposure is not a zero-sum game. Exposure to one medium does not mean less exposure to another.
- Maximizing cross-media synergy requires allocating proportionately more money to the less effective medium to equalize the impact of both. Rather than reallocate the budget to the less effective medium, under conditions of synergy, advertisers should increase the total media budget.
- Greater cross-media synergies appear to be achieved through the visual/verbal connection provided by TV and the Web than the verbal only connection provided by print and the Web.

59 Has the Time Finally Come for the Medium of the Future? Research on Mobile Advertising

SHINTARO OKAZAKI and PATRICK BARWISE

- Mobile advertising has been embraced by marketers as fully or as fast as many predicted 10 years ago. It now, however, is growing in importance, partly driven by new technologies such as the mobile Internet and QR codes.
- Most of the research on mobile advertising has focused on permission-based push advertising using SMS, especially the determinants of consumers' willingness to opt in to such messages.
- Cross-media consumer behavior is a promising area for future research, with the mobile channel (in some cases using QR codes or something similar) a fast, easy, ubiquitous response channel for other marketing media and promotions.
- There also has been no significant research to date on the ubiquity of mobile—one of its biggest benefits as a marketing channel—or on location-based mobile advertising and promotion.
- Most of the mobile-driven research has been conducted in Asia and Europe, with little in the United States. The growth of new mobile technologies (witness the iPad) and applications exploiting the channel's ubiquity and blurring the distinction between the fixed and mobile internet likely will encourage more U.S. research.

72 Instant Innovation: From Zero to Full Speed in Fifteen Years—How Online Offerings Have Reshaped Marketing Research

COLIN CAMPBELL, MICHAEL PARENT, and KIRK PLANGGER; Insights from GIAN M. FULGONI

- Despite a variety of articles addressing online research, only a few have been highly cited.
- Online research offers numerous advantages but, at the same time, well-known caveats. Research in the *Journal of Advertising Research* has contributed to addressing many of these issues.
- Researchers have yet to fully exploit the potential improvements that an online environment can offer respondents. As response rates continue to fall, innovation in this area grows increasingly vital.
- Understanding how and why consumers engage with the Internet is a precursor to designing—and measuring—appropriate advertising strategies.
- Sampling is equally important online. Though the Internet offers the possibility of improved representation, it presents challenges with survey noncompletion and incentive-driven duplicate respondents.

87 What Scanner-Panel Data Tell Us about Advertising: A Detective Story with a Dark Twist

SCOTT KOSLOW and GERARD J. TELLIS

- Scanner-panel data have long been important for understanding advertising's effects. Although the nature of advertising often has been investigated with scanner-panel data, the nature and value of scanner-panel data itself have rarely been considered. Although scanner-panel data are revered by many, they have measurement issues like any other complex data set.
- There are few areas in marketing where there is such an overlap between theory and practice as in the analysis of scanner-panel data. Professionals and academics often work together to explore these complex data, and this tradition goes back to some of the first scanner-panel articles.
- Learning about the situations when, where, and how advertising does have large effects is critical, and the future development of scanner-panel data does have a way to go to help answer these key questions. To make scanner-panel data more powerful, the authors recommend that choice data sets be augmented for their inherent weaknesses.

101 The Voice of the Consumer Speaks Forcefully in Brand Identity: User-Generated Content Forces Smart Marketers to Listen

GEORGE CHRISTODOULIDES and COLIN JEVONS; Insights from PETE BLACKSHAW

- User-generated content (UGC) is not new, but its context is: Customers have always been involved with products and brands but now, through technology, they are increasingly empowered to do so.
- Communications infrastructure has been democratized through interactive technologies so anyone can create and disseminate media content.

- Consumers have rarely been passive, unthinking recipients of advertising and peer-to-peer communications are becoming increasingly important.
- The power asymmetry between consumers and organizations is reversing in favor of consumers.
- The challenge for brands is how to reinvent their marketing to be attractive and engaging in this new context.

112 The Secret of Television's Success: Emotional Content or Rational Information? After Fifty Years the Debate Continues

ROBERT G. HEATH; Insights from HORST STIPP

- Television advertising has been the most successful form of advertising over the last 50 years, and current evidence suggests it continues to be effective at building strong brands.
- Although tradition has it that television advertising is persuasive and works best at high attention, this notion has been challenged repeatedly.
- Television advertising recall has been shown to have little connection with sales effect, and emotion has been found to be more effective at changing attitudes than rational messages.
- The most ardent proponents of an alternative explanation were Herb Krugman and Andrew Ehrenberg, neither of whom believed that persuasion was the driving force behind television advertising.
- Recent research suggests that the continued success of television advertising depends not on its ability to persuade but on how well it is able to influence emotions at low levels of attention.

124 The March to Reliable Metrics: A Half-century of Coming Closer to the Truth

EDITH G. SMIT and PETER C. NEIJENS

- Audience research for media planning should provide information on the power of media to get a message across, not on advertising effects.
- Although audience research aims at simple metrics, measurement is tremendously complicated.
- Single-source cross-media audience measurement is a pressing need for the near future.
- Media fragmentation will drive the demand for hybrid data collection in future audience research, including methods that use electronic and passive measurement of media use.
- The new media landscape requires new metrics such as measures of implicit processing of sponsored media content and measures of user-generated brand communications.

136 The Evolution of Services Advertising in a Services-Driven National Economy: An Analysis of Progress and Missed Opportunities

MARLA B. ROYNE STAFFORD, TIM REILLY, STEPHEN J. GROVE, and LES CARLSON;

Insights from RISHI BHANDARI and JOHN COPELAND

- The methodological rigor of services-advertising research has improved over the years as has the use of relevant theoretical foundations.
- Generalizable theory across service professions and industries has increased in the past 15 years, but there is still a long way to go.
- Many services advertising articles still are focused on a narrow class of service providers or a narrow topic.
- There is a need to provide more normative guidelines for services advertisers.
- The role of the Internet in services advertising needs to be studied.
- More scholars need to be engaged in services-advertising research.

153 Mapping the Unarticulated Potential of Qualitative Research: Stepping out from the Shadow of Quantitative Studies

PETER NUTTALL, AVI SHANKAR, and MICHAEL B. BEVERLAND; Insights from CHERYL STALLWORTH HOOPER

- This study details the contribution of qualitative methods to the development of advertising research in the 50-year history of the *Journal of Advertising Research*.
- A systematic review of every paper published in the *JAR* identifies four main contributions: improving managerial practice; developing new techniques for improving consumer understanding; keeping up to date with new developments in practice; and understanding new consumer segments.
- The research highlights the relative paucity of the use of qualitative methods (less than two percent of the total number of papers published) despite the widespread adoption of qualitative methods in the development of iconic brand advertising.
- Suggestions are made to enhance the role of qualitative methods in advertising research that include more widespread use of the wide variety of qualitative research techniques at the advertising researcher's disposal; using qualitative methods to build advertising theory; and ways to improve the practice and representation of qualitative research in the *Journal*.

167 Checking the Pulse of Print Media: Fifty Years of Newspaper and Magazine Advertising Research

GERGELY NYILASY, KAREN WHITEHILL KING, and LEONARD N. REID; Insights from SCOTT C. McDONALD

- “Recognition” versus “recall” as measures of advertising memory effects in print advertising are not an “either, or,” rather, a “yes, and...” question. Testing measure pluralism is supported by the research findings reviewed.
- Print advertising is improving in its portrayal of women and minorities: There is strong evidence that more equitable and progressive representations have been appearing over time.
- The traditional understanding of print as a rational medium (especially in contrast to emotional TV) should be contextualized by evidence that print advertising has become more visually focused over time, and it has documented emotional effects besides rational/cognitive ones.
- Engagement—the influence of editorial content/vehicle characteristics on advertising content effectiveness—is a phenomenon that has strong empirical support, especially in the area of print advertising.
- Despite significant efforts to improve media models and calculating cross-media estimates, work remains to be done to provide return on investment substantiation, especially as print editorial content and carried advertising continue to move to digital access platforms, such as Internet-enabled PCs, mobile phones, and tablet readers.

182 Brand Worlds: From Articulation to Integration

PIERRE BERTHON, LEYLAND F. PITT, RONIKA CHAKRABARTI, and JEAN-PAUL BERTHON;

Insights from MARIO SIMON

- This article provides advertising practitioners with a different perspective of how brands (from the past to the present) can be viewed as being manifest within three worlds: the objective “It,” the subjective “I,” and the inter-subjective or collective “We” as per four philosophical levels related to (1) ontology (What is a brand?) (2) epistemology (how to evaluate or measure brand value?) (3) methodology (how to strategically manage brands?) and (4) axiology (how do we create and employ brands ethically?)
- Keynote articles on branding literature from top academic and academic-practitioner journals over the past 50 years (from the perspective of Popper’s three Worlds) have been reviewed using a meta-theoretical framework to explore the integration of brands as a distinct alternative to existing frameworks.
- Our review reveals that the most dominant metaphysical categories representing brand research in each of the three worlds include the methodological, in the objective field of World 1; the ontological, in World 2; and finally, the epistemological, in World 3. The question of why and what has determined the constitution of these categories as the dominant remains elusive.

- Deliberation into the subdominant role of axiology as a metaphysical category is called for. The question of “how brands should be employed in the public sphere” needs further attention at a practitioner level.
- Continued reflection on how all three worlds would offer an integrated approach to branding is considered necessary.

195 How Relevancy, Use, and Impact Can Inform Decision Making: The Uses of Quantitative Research

DAVID W. STEWART and MIKE HESS; Insights from JEFF NELDER

- Although the conceptual foundations of quantitative research in advertising and marketing have their roots in work that dates to the early part of the twentieth century, it has only been in the past 50 years that these methods and tools have shaped research practice and management decision making. In this paper the authors discuss the most common uses of quantitative research in an advertising context and the more common methods used to inform these uses.
- Though there are many different decisions that may be informed by quantitative analysis, there are five broad classes of decisions for which quantitative analyses have become routine: market analysis, strategic direction, evaluation, market response and forecasting.
- Market-response modeling has had the most drastic changes over the past 25 years due to the increase in computer power, new sources of data, and the increase in the number of marketers with analytic skills.
- Lack of education with respect to quantitative methods, however, has been an impediment to wider adoption. Too often, a marketing decision maker is unacquainted with more sophisticated tools whereas the quantitative specialist often is unfamiliar with marketing and advertising decisions. This disparity suggests a need to create a new hybrid manager and trade-offs between methodological sophistication and a substantive understanding of management issues.